

## ARTICLE 1

From Title Page/Publishers' Page

What Happens to Us When We Die?

2006 Printing

<https://wol.jw.org/en/wol/d/r1/lp-e/1101998058>

ie pp. 22-24 What Happens to the Soul at Death?

10. Why is it unscriptural to believe that souls linger in purgatory after death, and how does the experience of Lazarus confirm this?

<sup>10</sup> However, as we have seen, the soul is simply the person. When the person dies, the soul dies. Hence, there is no conscious existence after death. Indeed, when Lazarus died, Jesus Christ did not say that he was in purgatory, Limbo, or any other “intermediate state.” Rather, Jesus simply said: “Lazarus has fallen asleep.” ([John 11:11](#), *New English Bible*) Clearly, Jesus, who knew the truth about what happens to the soul at death, believed that Lazarus was unconscious, **nonexistent**.

What Is the Spirit?

11. Why could the word “spirit” not refer to a disembodied part of a person that survives death?

<sup>11</sup> The Bible says that when a person dies, “his spirit goes out, he goes back to his ground.” ([Psalm 146:4](#)) Does this mean that a disembodied spirit literally departs and lives on after a person’s death? That could not be, for the psalmist next says: “In that day his thoughts do perish” (“all his thinking ends,” *NEB*). What, then, is the spirit, and how does it ‘go out’ from a person at the time of his death?

12. What is implied by the Hebrew and Greek words translated “spirit” in the Bible?

<sup>12</sup> In the Bible the words translated “spirit” (Hebrew, *ru'ach*; Greek, *pneu'ma*) basically mean “breath.” Thus, instead of “his spirit goes out,” the translation by R. A. Knox uses the phrase “the breath leaves his body.” (Psalm 145:4, *Knox*) But the word “spirit” implies much more than the act of breathing. For example, in describing the destruction of human and animal life at the time of the global Deluge, [Genesis 7:22](#) says: “Everything in which the breath of the force [or, spirit; Hebrew, *ru'ach*] of life was active in its nostrils, namely, all that were on the dry ground, died.” So “spirit” can refer to the life-force that is active in all living creatures, both humans and animals, and that is sustained by breathing.

13. In what way may the spirit be likened to electric current?

<sup>13</sup> To illustrate: Electric current powers a piece of equipment. If the current stops, the equipment ceases to function. The current does not take on a life of its own. Similarly, when a person dies, his spirit ceases to animate the body cells. It does not leave the body and move on to another realm.—[Psalm 104:29](#).

14, 15. How does the spirit return to God at death?

<sup>14</sup> Why, then, does [Ecclesiastes 12:7](#) state that when a person dies, “the spirit itself returns to the true God who gave it”? Does this mean that the spirit literally travels through space into God’s presence? Nothing of the sort is implied. Remember, the spirit is the life-force. Once that life-force is gone, only God has the ability to restore it. So the spirit “returns to the true God” in the sense that any hope of future life for that person now rests entirely with God.

<sup>15</sup> Only God can restore the spirit, or life-force, causing a person to come back to life. ([Psalm 104:30](#)) But does God intend to do so?

“He Will Rise” Page 25-26

6. What does the term “resurrection” mean?

<sup>6</sup> The word “resurrection” is translated from the Greek word *a-na'sta-sis*, which literally means “a standing up again.” Hebrew translators of the Greek have rendered *a-na'sta-sis* with the Hebrew words *techi-yath' ham-me-thim'*, meaning “revival of the dead.”\* Thus, resurrection involves raising the person from the lifeless condition of death—reactivating the life pattern of the individual.

7. Why will the resurrection of individuals pose no problem for Jehovah God and Jesus Christ?

<sup>7</sup> Being infinite in wisdom and perfect in memory, Jehovah God can easily resurrect a person. Remembering the life pattern of dead ones—their personality traits, their personal history, and all the details of their identity—is not a problem for him. ([Job 12:13](#); compare [Isaiah 40:26](#).) Jehovah is also the Originator of life. Hence, he can readily bring back to life the same person, giving him or her the same personality in a newly formed body. Moreover, as the experience of Lazarus indicates, Jesus Christ is both willing and able to resurrect the dead.—Compare [Luke 7:11-17](#); [8:40-56](#).

8, 9. (a) Why are the resurrection and the idea of the immortality of the soul incompatible?

(b) What is the remedy for death?

<sup>8</sup> The Scriptural teaching of the resurrection, however, is not compatible with the doctrine of the immortality of the soul. If an immortal soul survived death, no one would need to be resurrected, or brought back to life. Indeed, Martha expressed no thought about an immortal soul that was living on elsewhere after death. She did not believe that Lazarus had already gone to some spirit realm to continue his existence. On the contrary, she showed her faith in God’s purpose to reverse the effects of death. She said: “I know he will rise in the resurrection on the last day.” ([John 11:23, 24](#)) Likewise, Lazarus himself related no experiences of some afterlife. There was nothing to report.

<sup>9</sup> Clearly, according to the Bible, the soul dies and the remedy for death is the resurrection. But billions of people have died since the first man, Adam, walked the earth. So who will be resurrected, and where?

‘All in the Memorial Tombs’

10. What promise did Jesus make regarding those in the memorial tombs?

<sup>10</sup> Jesus Christ said: “The hour is coming in which all those in the *memorial* tombs will hear his [Jesus’] voice and come out.” ([John 5:28, 29](#)) Yes, Jesus Christ promised that all those in Jehovah’s memory will be resurrected. Billions of people have lived and died. Who among them are in God’s memory, awaiting the resurrection?

## ARTICLE 2

<https://www.jw.org/en/library/books/bible-study/glossary/#p57-p66>

The Hebrew and Greek words translated “spirit” in the English edition of the *New World Translation* can mean different things. Yet they always refer to something invisible to humans, such as the wind or the breath of humans and animals. These words may also refer to spirit persons and to the holy spirit, which is God’s active force. The Bible does not teach that a separate part of a person keeps on living after he dies.—[Exodus 35:21](#); [Psalm 104:29](#); [Matthew 12:43](#); [Luke 11:13](#).

▸ [Chap. 6, par. 5](#); [Chap. 15, par. 17](#)

<https://www.jw.org/en/library/books/good-news-from-god/what-hope-for-the-dead/>

Humans are made from dust. ([Genesis 2:7](#); [3:19](#)) We are not spirits living in a body of flesh. We are physical creatures, so no part of us survives death. When we die, our brain dies too, and our thoughts perish. Thus, Lazarus said nothing about his experience of death because the dead are unconscious.—*Read [Psalm 146:4](#); [Ecclesiastes 9:5, 6, 10](#).*

<https://www.jw.org/en/library/magazines/wp20121101/what-happens-when-you-die/>

Adam chose to ignore God’s warning. He sinned when he disobeyed God, so he died. ([Romans 6:23](#)) No part of Adam survived his death. Rather, at death Adam ceased to exist. God said to Adam: “In the sweat of your face you will eat bread until you return to the ground, for out of it you were taken. For dust you are and to dust you will return.” ([Genesis 3:19](#)) Because all mankind descended from Adam, we inherited sin and death from him.—[Romans 5:12](#).

Jesus did not agree with the religious leaders of his day who said that there would be no resurrection of the dead. ([Luke 20:27](#)) Neither did he teach that some part of a person survives death. Rather, Jesus taught the following.

<https://www.jw.org/en/library/books/bible-teach/where-are-the-dead/>

<sup>4</sup> Such religious teachings all share one basic idea—that some part of us survives the death of the physical body. According to almost every religion, past and present, we somehow live on forever with the ability to see, hear, and think. Yet, how can that be? Our senses, along with our thoughts, are all linked to the workings of our brain. At death, the brain stops working. Our memories, feelings, and senses do not continue to function independently in some mysterious way. They do not survive the destruction of our brain.

WHAT REALLY HAPPENS AT DEATH?

5, 6. What does the Bible teach about the condition of the dead?

<sup>5</sup> What happens at death is no mystery to Jehovah, the Creator of the brain. He knows the truth, and in his Word, the Bible, he explains the condition of the dead. Its clear teaching is this: *When a person dies, he ceases to exist.* Death is the opposite of life. The dead do not see or hear or think. Not even one part of us survives the death of the body. We do not possess an [immortal soul or spirit](#). \*



Where did the flame go?

<sup>6</sup> After Solomon observed that the living know that they will die, he wrote: “But the dead know *nothing at all*.” He then enlarged on that basic truth by saying that the dead can neither love nor hate and that “there is no work nor planning nor knowledge nor wisdom in the Grave.” (Read [Ecclesiastes 9:5, 6, 10](#).) Similarly, [Psalm 146:4](#) says that when a man dies, “his thoughts perish.” We are mortal and do not survive the death of our body. The life we enjoy is like the flame of a candle. When the flame is put out, it does not *go* anywhere. It is simply gone.

## ARTICLE 3

<http://adamjnicolai.com/uploading-your-brain/>

### Uploading Your Brain

March 3, 2014

A year or so ago I had a little argument with a couple friends of mine about whether human consciousness could be transferred into a computer. (Incidentally, yes, this is why they are my friends.)

I'm still not certain if they were actually advocating for the position they took, or just playing devil's advocate because it seemed to be flustering me so much, but they argued that human consciousness could be transferred. The basic idea being that if you could copy all the data out of a human brain and into a storage unit of some kind (say, a hard drive), then destroy the original at the exact same time, what you've done is "transfer" consciousness out of a human storage unit and into a digital one.

Now, I don't have a problem with the basic premise here – that the data in the human brain can be copied/uploaded. I'm sure it can. The problem I have is pretending that destroying the "original" – or, as we sometimes call it, murder – doesn't have any implications for the process.

The conversation bugged me because I couldn't articulate my opposition very well. I kept saying something vague about how the two entities (original and copy) would be facing different directions and having different experiences. But now, finally, months and months later, Susan Schneider did it for me.

Here's the line that grabbed me: "If Theodore were to undergo this procedure, would he succeed in transferring himself into the digital realm? Or would he, as I suspect, succeed only in killing himself, leaving behind a computational copy of his mind[?]"

Ding, ding, ding. She hit perfectly on my issues here.

My friends had argued there was no difference. If my brain is destroyed at the exact same instant that the digital copy becomes live, my stream of experiences is uninterrupted. All the data in that set of experiences is being perceived by the consciousness in the exact same way.

The opinions, memories, and life-shaping events are all the exact same. Because there was no divergence in experience, goes the argument, the copy is still fundamentally me.

I don't agree. I think Ms. Schneider's got the right of it. In essence, what you're talking about here is a remarkably adept and difficult act of illusion. You're destroying one consciousness and creating another at the same time. Just because you do it under a blanket and try to gloss over the details doesn't change the fact that a consciousness is being destroyed. The illusion can easily come apart at the edges with even the slightest deviation from this hypothetical (and, by the way, absolutely perfectly executed) script. If I (the original) am destroyed just an instant after the copy goes live, it can make all the difference. In that instant I can change my mind about agreeing to the procedure, and that data is lost. The "new me" never "knows" that it changed its mind at the last instant; this shows that we're talking about two consciousnesses, not one. If I'm destroyed an instant before the copy goes live (instead of simultaneously), then the cracks show. During that intervening second, there was no "me." There is an instant of universal experience that neither I nor my copy ever experienced. I wasn't just dead during that time. I actually didn't exist at all.

But suddenly, when the switch is flipped, I exist again?

My point here is not that the procedure has to be executed flawlessly to work. My point here is that these questions demonstrate that you're not talking about a single consciousness. You're talking about two. The copy may be a perfect copy of my consciousness as it existed at a single point in time. It may even be "another" me. But that doesn't negate the fact that the original exists or existed. Murdering the original me to try to maintain the illusion of a single consciousness is just that – murder. (Unless I agree to the procedure, perhaps because I'm terminally ill or something – then it may not be murder, but it's still a copy, not the same consciousness.)

To put it another way, say your daughter has a pet goldfish and it dies while she's at school. You go out and get a new goldfish. By all outside appearances, it is identical. It is the same size and completely indistinguishable from the original goldfish. Its behaviors are completely identical. You plop it in the bowl, and when your daughter comes home, she has no idea that the first goldfish died.

Just because you successfully tricked her into thinking the new goldfish is the same as the old one, doesn't mean the first goldfish is still alive.

Another example, more closely tied to the actual scenario. It seems to me that the safest way to perform this procedure would be to keep the original subject alive during the copy, if possible. That way, if something went wrong, you could retry it without harming the individual until absolutely necessary. Of course, that opens the door to the possibility of multiple copies of the same consciousness, and also quite clearly demonstrates a deviation in the knowledge of the copy and the original. At some point, you'll have to tell the original person, "Okay, that copy went off without a hitch and we're going to kill you now." That person will then have to agree or change their minds. Do you kill them anyway? After all, you have a copy now, so why should this legacy copy's opinion matter?

What we're really talking about here is copying data, no different than the way zillions of bits of data move around our world every day. But when we send a file over email, the original file stays on our hard drive. When we download an .mp3, a source .mp3 remains on the server. Take the example of a manuscript. I have an .ftp file with about 45,000 different copies of the Alex, Rebecca, and Children manuscripts. (Especially Children. Yeesh.) If I send someone one of those files, they can edit it, delete it, or do whatever they want with it. Likewise, I keep an original, which I can also change, merge with something else, or do anything else with. If I delete the original, we pretend that it's just one continuous document and we all agree to only use the new one that was sent over. But the two documents are completely separate. I may have deleted the original, but I could just as easily have continued editing it, kept it for nostalgia purposes, or just totally forgotten I had it. If that had happened, the two files would've diverged very quickly. Any changes in one would not affect the other. They become unique sets of data.

Of course, deleting a manuscript copy is no big deal (provided there's a backup). But when you stop talking about "just data" and you start talking about consciousnesses embedded in a file (or a human brain!), it seems to me that you need to re-examine all the assumptions you ever held about the sanctity of data.

Deleting information is one thing. Deleting enough information that it's actually considered a "consciousness" is something else.

That then opens a whole host of new questions: Is it ethical to delete the consciousness as long as it's not "active?" For example, if it's actually just a file of information, but not perceiving, thinking, or interacting with the world in any way? Should a file on a server be treated the same as a sleeping person, or maybe as a comatose person?

Fascinating questions. I should write a book about this.



Share this:

FacebookTwitterRedditEmail

2 Comments/in Uncategorized/by Adam Nicolai

2 replies

BREANNEsays:

March 3, 2014 at 6:32 pm

One must also wonder about the implications for the post-transferred “consciousness.” Is it self-aware enough to recognize that it is not in the same body as the original? And how does that affect it’s own perception of self? Would IT argue that it is, in fact, the same consciousness?

Then add into the fact that neuroscience has demonstrated that our memories are pretty much smoke and mirrors (check out “Brain Rules” by Medina for an accessible, fascinating read on this). What we think we “remember” is actually recreated \*and changed\* every time we recall it – which means that every time you recall something, the memory changes and then that changed memory is what is put back into long-term storage for retrieval the next time!

In that case, what does the process of retrieving those “memories” through a different system do to the memories? If it is a computerized storage, then one could argue that it would always have ‘perfect’ recall of whatever state the memory was in when it was transferred in ... which is certainly NOT the case, had it remained within a human brain.

Reply

ADAM NICOLAIsays:

March 3, 2014 at 9:00 pm

“Implications for the post-transferred consciousness...”

That’s an excellent point. I imagine that would depend partially on whether the person undergoing the procedure did so of their own will, and what they think of the circumstances they find themselves in when it’s over. Now that I think about it, I’m betting most people would be horrified at the loss of their body. What kind of existence would it be for a sentience has been tied for millions of years to a biological organism?

Really interesting points about the way memory works, too. What's fascinating to me is the idea that in trying to do something like this, we would actually break the process – that it somehow relies on that constant recreation of memory. That maybe by having everything get recalled with perfect clarity every time, we would break something. Maybe we rely on that recreation mechanic, somehow.

Reply

LEAVE A REPLY

Want to join the discussion?

Feel free to contribute!

search site

Newsletter

Sign up for free, exclusive fiction from Adam, plus release dates, updates, bargains, and more. He won't share your address or email you more than twice a month.

Email\*

Subscribe

CONNECT WITH ADAM

Meet Adam - Biography, interviews, appearances, media coverage and more. Connect with Adam on Facebook Connect with Adam on Twitter

No eReader? No problem!

PopularRecentTags

“The New Alex Cover” – or, “Why...

February 16, 2013 - 1:51 am

Mandatory Indoctrination

December 30, 2011 - 11:12 pm

The Good, The Bad, And The... Well, Just The Good And...

September 1, 2012 - 6:54 am

Total Control! Wait, Is That a Good Thing?

January 18, 2012 - 3:25 pm

**READ OLDER POSTS**

Read Older Posts

#### ARTICLE 4

I have a theological and philosophical question and I am hopeful that you can help me evaluate my understanding of an issue. I have an interest in JW apologetics and I have not seen this issue addressed. Both Christians and JWs acknowledge an immaterial part of our being that we identify as “me”. In Christian theology that conscious “me” continues on past death whether asleep or awake. However, in Watchtower theology, because the soul is the result of the physical body combining with the impersonal life force of God to create a soul, they believe the soul perishes at death. According to JW theology when a person dies the body decays, the soul is extinguished, no longer existing and the life force returns to God.<sup>1</sup> Since much of their theology is dependent on resurrection to Paradise Earth, I wanted to explore their understanding of death.

If my computer hard drive malfunctions and the software is rendered inoperable, I can have it repaired. When the problem is fixed the technician can download new software. That software is absolutely identical to the previous software. It may even include settings that have been stored on a backup of the original. When operable, from the outside it appears to be exactly the same software but internally it is not. It is a copy. The original is gone. In the same way it seems to be true that given the Watchtower understanding of death, the soul as we knew it, the “me” of the person has been extinguished. So, when God, following Armageddon, resurrects the great crowd and those who did not really have a chance to know Jesus, he is creating copies of what had previously existed. It is not, indeed cannot be, the original since by definition it has been extinguished. Therefore, to say to a person that Jehovah is going to resurrect them in the last day is a falsehood. The person who is being told this will be extinguished and will be replaced, not by the original, but by a copy. This, if correct, undermines all their eschatology. So, am I correct in assuming that if I follow their theology it means that all those who die are lost forever and only their copy will return? The “me” that was “them” is gone?

1 (See What Happens to Us When We Die? 2006 Printing <https://wol.jw.org/en/wol/d/r1/lp-e/1101998058> ie pp. 22-24 What Happens to the Soul at Death? and 25-26.)

## ARTICLE 5

JW intermediate state refutes resurrection?

I have been wrestling with something for a while. Could I get some feedback from the Christian theologians on the list. My computer was dropped and the hard drive damaged. It required repair. The old Windows Ten died but the technician re-installed Windows 10. From the outside it looks exactly like the original, it had been stored perfectly among Microsoft's software, it was easily installed. It does everything just as perfectly as the original. From the outside there appears to be no difference. But from the inside it seems that there has to be a difference. The original is gone and this is a copy. For my computer this makes no difference. However, the Watchtower teaches about paradise earth and the resurrection of those who have died. All the faithful JWs and those who have not had a chance to make a decision are said to be resurrected after Armageddon. But the Watchtower describes death as the body dying and the Life Spirit returning to God. (See What Happens to Us When We Die? 2006 Printing <https://wol.jw.org/en/wol/d/r1/lp-e/1101998058> ie pp. 22-24 What Happens to the Soul at Death? and 25-26.) The soul ceases to exist and is stored in God's memory. This is little different than my computer example. If God recreates a person they are a copy. From the outside they would appear to be identical. But from the inside they would not, could not be the same person. Even with memory intact they are still a copy. If my reasoning is correct (and I am open to change it) the theology of the Watchtower rules out real resurrection and is a sham. Were their theology correct, God would produce copies but the real and original person would have perished forever. That is hardly resurrection and appears to invalidate the idea of Paradise Earth for those who are living, as they will never see it. What do you think???

This is an authorized Web site of Jehovah's Witnesses. It is a research tool for publications in various languages produced by Jehovah's Witnesses.

WOL.JW.ORG

What Happens to the Soul at Death? — Watchtower ONLINE LIBRARY

This is an authorized Web site of Jehovah's Witnesses. It is a research tool for publications in various languages produced by Jehovah's...

This is an authorized Web site of Jehovah's Witnesses. It is a research tool for publications in various languages produced by Jehovah's Witnesses.

8Bridget Christine Anderson and 7 others

70 Comments

Like

Comment

Share

Comments

Larry Madigan

Larry Madigan '...we may expect 1925 to witness the return of these faithful men of Israel from the condition of death, being resurrected' (Millions Now Living Will Never Die, 1920, p. 88) AND YET THEY SAY . . . What does resurrection actually mean to a Jehovah Witness? "What will be resurrected? The body? NO. for it has disintegrated . . . (W.T p.346 June 1, 1959) It appears to me they are teaching "copy" and not resurrection.

3

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 3d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema If they are teaching "copy" this is another place where the wheels come off the cart. They promise a resurrection that logically cannot occur.

3

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams The word Anastasia, Greek for Resurrection means "To stand up," not copy!

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 18h · Edited

Lee Attema

Lee Attema I am..... That is I have a basic identity. I exist. If I perish and God makes a copy of me, the I am is gone. It is someone else. This strikes me as a major issue. I don't see how it can be avoided.

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Kevin Helms

Kevin Helms The Jehovah's Witnesses believe in a recreated physical body, not a rising up of the original body. They also believe that this recreated body will be given the same "life-force" as the original person with all the persons personality including that persons traits, sinful tendencies, memories, etc...

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema Yes but logically/philosophically can that be true that the resurrected person is the same person? In traditional Christianity the persons awareness survives death because that portion of the person that is "them" is not extinguished. In the JW scheme the "them" is extinguished. I cannot see how a "recreated from memory" person is the "same" person. It is a copy and the copy is not the original. They might make the claim that it is the same but unless I am willing to acquiesce to their definition I don't think it works.

1

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d · Edited

Kevin Helms

Kevin Helms Lee Attema I agree. The JW's have an entirely different vocabulary than traditional Christianity. This phrase "life-force" is one example. They believe the "life-force" is an impersonal thing that returns to God and can be given back to another recreated body with all the same traits and characteristics as the one before, yet they don't believe in a separation between the soul and the body. It doesn't make any sense at all. Why would Jehovah give you back your sinful condition in the "resurrected" body if you have already died and paid for your sins according to their interpretation of Romans 6:23? It's like they believe that when you die Jehovah presses a pause button on your existence like in a video game, and then comes back later to unpaue the game after giving your character a new look to start playing at another level.

3

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams The real person is either with God or in hades awaiting a resurrection of the just and unjust Daniel 12:1-2; John 5:28-29; Acts 24:15; Revelation 20:4-6; 21:8. Cross reference to 1 Samuel 28:15-19; Luke 16:19-31; 2 Corinthians 5:8.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 17h · Edited

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams Philippians 1:20-23 KJV

20 According to my earnest expectation and my hope, that in nothing I shall be ashamed, but that with all boldness, as always, so now also Christ shall be magnified in my body, whether it be by life, or by death.

21 For to me to live is Christ, and to die is gain.

22 But if I live in the flesh, this is the fruit of my labour: yet what I shall choose I wot not.

23 For I am in a strait betwixt two, having a desire to depart, and to be with Christ; which is far better:

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 17h

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams Hebrews 12:21-23 King James Version (KJV)

21 And so terrible was the sight, that Moses said, I exceedingly fear and quake:)

22 But ye are come unto mount Sion, and unto the city of the living God, the heavenly Jerusalem, and to an innumerable company of angels,

23 To the general assembly and church of the firstborn, which are written in heaven, and to God the Judge of all, and to the spirits of just men made perfect,

Hide or report this

Like



· Reply · 17h

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams Hebrews 11:13-16, KJV

13 These all died in faith, not having received the promises, but having seen them afar off, and were persuaded of them, and embraced them, and confessed that they were strangers and pilgrims on the earth.

14 For they that say such things declare plainly that they seek a country.

15 And truly, if they had been mindful of that country from whence they came out, they might have had opportunity to have returned.

16 But now they desire a better country, that is, an heavenly: wherefore God is not ashamed to be called their God: for he hath prepared for them a city.

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 17h

Lee Attema

Write a reply...

Ron Dallas

Ron Dallas Jeremiah 32:27 Behold, I am the LORD, the God of all flesh. Is anything too hard for me?

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema Could you add a bit so I can follow what you are saying?

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema Just thinking about those verses and how they might apply here. I would say that nothing logical is too hard for God. Some things have no basis in logic. Can God make a four sided triangle or produce a married bachelor, can he create a stone so heavy he cannot move it. We recognize all of these as logical absurdities. In the same way, could God make a copy to be the original? The original has perished, that is granted. By definition the recreation is going to be a copy and it cannot be the original. In that scheme whatever makes me "I am" was extinguished. If another me is recreated it is a copy and though it may have its own sense of "I am" the original "I am" is gone forever.

1

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Ron Dallas

Ron Dallas Lee Attema to me if God can form man out of the dust of the earth then to recreate the exact image is not an illogical possibility.

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d · Edited

Ron Dallas

Ron Dallas Lee Attema if God is the God of all flesh what does it say about how powerful God is of he cannot put something he created back to its original form and substance.

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema Ron Dallas Thanks for explaining. The point I am making is not that God cannot put something he created back into its original form and substance. Christian resurrection does something of that nature. The point is that because the original has perished the reproduction is by necessity a copy. A copy is not the original. So what I have considered my essence "me" is no longer "me" but a copy of "me". Externally it (like a computer software installation) appears identical but it is not the original. So if the JW theology of the intermediate state is correct (and I would not grant that) and I died, at the resurrection it would not be "me" but a copy of "me" that is present. The original essence, the "me" has been extinguished by their definition. I am not yet sure of my conclusion but the more I ponder this the more likely I think it is to be correct. If

correct it has the potential to be an interesting apologetic with a number of significant ramifications.

1

[Edit or delete this](#)

[Like](#)

[· Reply · 2d](#)

Ron Dallas

Ron Dallas Lee Attema stick to scripture. He is the God of all flesh. Ask them is it too hard for God to recreate the same person? Is it something God cannot do? Certainly there is no scripture which says he cannot do it.

[Hide or report this](#)

[Like](#)

[· Reply · 2d](#)

Lee Attema

Lee Attema Ron Dallas Thanks for the comment. I think we may be discussing to different aspects of the question. The reason the question has arisen is that the Watchtower has made a statement that has no direct Scriptural foundation. The claim is that at death the body decays, the soul ceases to exist and the life force returns to God. Therefore there is no "I am" or "me" that exists. The traditional position is that the soul, that part of us that we might call the "I am" or "me" does not cease to exist-whether it is asleep or whether it is conscious. So my response cannot be directly scriptural since the Bible doesn't promote their position. Rather I am noticing that their argument seems to preclude the ongoing existence of the original "I am" or "we" that we intuitively believe to continue. If we no longer exist, God may make a copy but he cannot make the original. The original is gone. The copy may be identical but the original "me" has been replaced by a copy of "me". It may sound arcane but if that is the argument I believe the Watchtower is promising a resurrection (of the original) that it cannot provide.

[Edit or delete this](#)

[Like](#)

[· Reply · 2d](#)

Lee Attema

[Write a reply...](#)

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso I don't have the verses in front of me, but when Rachel was giving birth to Benjamin, the Bible says her soul left (because she was dying).

Also, when Elijah was staying with the widow and her son died, Elijah spread his body across the boy's body and prayed, and the Bible says the boy's soul returned to his body.

Furthermore, in Revelation 6:9-11, John sees the souls of those who had been martyred (beheaded) for the word of God and their faith. They were conscious and asking when their deaths would be avenged.

The same souls appear again to John in Revelation 20:4. They will rule with Jesus for a thousand years before the Great White Throne judgment.

1Thessalonians 5:23 says humans have a spirit, a soul, and a body.

There are a lot of similarities between the soul and the spirit, but they are distinct from one another - yet both live on after the death of the physical body

James 2:26 says Works without faith is dead, just like the body without the spirit is dead.

Ecclesiastes 12:7 says upon death, the body goes back to the dust from where it came, and the spirit goes back to God from where it came.

Similar things happen to the soul as happen to the spirit

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Hide 19 Replies

Lee Attema

Lee Attema Yes, I am in agreement that the portion which I am calling the "I am", continues on past death. This is different than the theology of the Watchtower, which teaches that the portion we identify as self, the "I am", is extinguished. The life force goes back to God and that is it. I am trying to determine if their approach to the intermediate state has doomed their understanding of resurrection. I do not think their position can be sustained. However, I am still trying to flesh out the thought process and see if I am wrong. If I am wrong I lose nothing as it does not affect my position but if I am right it does invalidate the entire logic of resurrection in their system.

2

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso I agree that their position can be sustained, and that you are right, Lee Attema. Your position (and mine, since we are in agreement that the portion which you are calling the "I am," and I call the ongoing life of the soul and spirit continues on past the death of the physical body) invalidates the entire logic of resurrection in the JW's system.

Here are some things - both my own words and Scripture - that I have put together and saved to a Word document for use whenever I need it so I don't have to "re-invent the wheel" and re-create the same document repeatedly each time I need the information. Please feel free to use or modify as you see fit any, all, or none of the following:

Humans are created in the image and likeness of God (Genesis 1:26-27). God is triune – Father, Son and Holy Spirit – humans are tripartite – body, soul, and spirit (1 Thessalonians 5:23 Now may the God of peace Himself sanctify you COMPLETELY; and may your whole SPIRIT, SOUL, and BODY be preserved blameless at the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ.)

When our physical bodies – like that of Jesus' body – die, our spirit and soul live on for eternity – as did Jesus'.

That's how Jesus could say, "Therefore My Father loves Me, because I lay down MY LIFE that I may take it again. 18 No one takes it from Me, but I lay it down of Myself. I have power to lay it down, and I have power to take it again. This command I have received from My Father." (John 10:17-18 – cross reference with Leviticus 17:11 For THE LIFE OF THE FLESH [aka body] IS IN THE BLOOD, and I have given it to you upon the altar to make atonement for your SOULS; for it is the BLOOD [which is in the body] that makes atonement for THE SOUL.)

That's also how Jesus could say to the Jews after He had cleansed the temple of the money changers who asked Him, "What sign do You show to us, since You do these things?" 19 "Jesus answered and said to them, "DESTROY THIS TEMPLE, AND IN THREE DAYS I WILL RAISE IT UP." 20 Then the Jews said, "It has taken forty-six years to build this temple, and will You raise it up in three days?" 21 But HE WAS SPEAKING OF THE TEMPLE OF HIS BODY. 22 Therefore, when He had risen from the dead, His disciples remembered that He had said this to them; and they believed the Scripture and the word which Jesus had said.

For those who have asked, "Where does Jesus say He would raise His own body?" John 2:18-22 above!

Jesus also said to His disciples, after His resurrection, "Behold My hands and My feet, that it is I MYSELF. Handle Me and see, for A SPIRIT DOES NOT HAVE FLESH AND BONES [He did not say "flesh and blood," as in 1 Corinthians 15:50] AS YOU SEE I HAVE." (Luke 24:39)

And for those who have asked, "How could God die and raise (especially Himself) from the dead?"

The ongoing, into eternity, life of Jesus' soul and spirit raised His then immortal, glorified flesh and bones temple of His own body on the third day after He had allowed it to be put to death! Only His body died, but His spirit and soul never ceased to live. That's how – as God – Jesus could die and still rise from the dead!

The same was the case for David, as Peter stated on the day of Pentecost in Acts 2:34. "...David did not ascend into the heavens..." David's BODY did not ascend into the heavens, but his soul and spirit did – just like those of all the Old Testament patriarchs and prophets before Jesus. Jesus said, "No one has ascended to heaven but He who came down from heaven, that is, the Son of Man...(John 3:13)"

By the way, when did the Son of Man – before His conversation with Nicodemus - ascend to heaven? Hint – in His pre-incarnate state as the Angel of the Lord/Angel of God in JUDGES 13:3-23 (cross reference with Exodus 33:18-23) where His name is Wonderful (cross reference with Isaiah 9:6) and He is called the LORD – YHWH - and God!

Luke 20:34-38 Jesus answered and said to them, "The sons of this age marry and are given in marriage. 35 But those who are counted worthy to attain that age, and the resurrection from the dead, neither marry nor are given in marriage; 36 nor can they die anymore, for they are equal to the angels and are sons of God, being sons of the resurrection. 37 But even Moses showed in the burning bush passage that the dead are raised, when he called the Lord 'the God of Abraham, the God of Isaac, and the God of Jacob.' 38 For HE IS NOT THE GOD OF THE DEAD BUT OF THE LIVING, FOR ALL LIVE TO HIM." (AND NOT JUST IN GOD'S MEMORY! JW's use of Malachi 3:16 is used out of context!).

Matthew 8:11 And I say to you that many will come from east and west, and sit down with Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob IN THE KINGDOM OF HEAVEN.

Hebrews 12:23 to the general assembly and church of the firstborn who are registered IN HEAVEN, to God the Judge of all, to THE SPIRITS OF JUST MEN MADE PERFECT,

Revelation 6:9-11; 20:4 When He opened the fifth seal, I SAW UNDER THE ALTAR THE SOULS [Strong's number 5590: ψυχὰς, psychas - the human soul as the seat of affections and will], OF THOSE WHO HAD BEEN SLAIN FOR THE WORD OF GOD AND FOR THE TESTIMONY WHICH THEY HELD. 10 And they cried with a loud voice, saying, "How long, O Lord, holy and true, until You judge and avenge our blood on those who dwell on the earth?" 11 Then a white robe was given to each of them; and it was said to them that they should rest a little while longer, until both the number of their fellow servants and their brethren, who would be killed as they were, was completed.

These same souls were separate from their bodies (at least their heads)...

20:4-5 And I saw thrones, and they sat on them, and judgment was committed to them. THEN I SAW THE SOULS OF THOSE WHO HAD BEEN BEHEADED FOR THEIR WITNESS TO JESUS AND FOR THE WORD OF GOD, who had not worshiped the beast or his image, and had not received his mark on their foreheads or on their hands. And they lived and reigned with Christ for a thousand years. 5 BUT THE REST OF THE DEAD [bodies] DID NOT LIVE AGAIN UNTIL THE THOUSAND YEARS WERE FINISHED. THIS is the first resurrection.

The souls that John saw under the altar in Revelation 6:9 are the same souls John saw in Revelation 20:4. They were alive and in heaven BEFORE the first resurrection, by more than a thousand years!

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema David Alesso Thank you. I do intend to save you comments. I try to do that when people make a good point or present a novel idea.

3

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Lee Attema You're welcome. Here's more.

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Lee Attema Here are some verses from Ecclesiastes for you, plus some other verses that prove the spirit and soul live on after our physical bodies die:

Ecclesiastes 3:21 Who knows the SPIRIT OF THE SONS OF MEN, which GOES UPWARD, and the spirit of the animal, which goes down to the earth?

Ecclesiastes 8:8 No one has power over the spirit TO RETAIN THE SPIRIT, and no one has power in the day of death. There is no release from that war, and wickedness will not deliver those who are given to it.

Ecclesiastes 12:7 Then the dust will return to the earth as it was, And THE SPIRIT WILL RETURN TO GOD WHO GAVE IT.

Luke 23:46 And when Jesus had cried out with a loud voice, He said, "Father, 'into Your hands I commit MY SPIRIT.'" Having said this, He breathed His last.

Acts 7:59 And they stoned Stephen as he was calling on God and saying, "Lord Jesus, RECEIVE MY SPIRIT."

1 Corinthians 5:5 deliver such a one to Satan for the destruction of the flesh, THAT HIS SPIRIT MAY BE SAVED in the day of the Lord Jesus.

2 Corinthians 5:8 We are confident, yes, well pleased rather to be ABSENT FROM THE BODY and TO BE PRESENT WITH THE LORD.

James 2:26 For as THE BODY WITHOUT THE SPIRIT IS DEAD, so faith without works is dead also.

A theological point is involved in the placing of a comma in Luke 23:43. According to the traditional way of understanding the passage, the repentant robber asked Jesus on the cross to remember him when Jesus entered His kingdom. To this request Jesus responded, "Truly I say to you, today you will be with Me in paradise." In the interest of supporting the doctrine of "soul sleep" held by Jehovah's Witnesses, the translators of the New World Translation of the Christian Greek Scriptures have moved the comma so that the verse reads, "Truly I tell you today, You will be with me in Paradise." But >>>surely here the robber knew that Jesus was speaking to him that day,<<< and so the correct punctuation is that of traditional translations.

Luke 16:19-31 "There was a certain rich man who was clothed in purple and fine linen and fared sumptuously every day. 20 But there was a certain beggar named Lazarus, full of sores, who was laid at his gate, 21 desiring to be fed with the crumbs which fell from the rich man's table. Moreover, the dogs came and licked his sores. 22 So it was that the beggar died, AND WAS CARRIED BY THE ANGELS TO ABRAHAM'S BOSOM [where Abraham resided – see Luke 20:34-38 and Matthew 8:11 above] . THE RICH MAN ALSO DIED and was buried. 23 AND BEING IN [conscious] TORMENTS IN HADES, he lifted up his eyes and SAW ABRAHAM AFAR OFF, AND LAZARUS in his bosom. 24 "THEN HE CRIED AND SAID, 'Father Abraham, have mercy on me, and send Lazarus that he may dip the tip of his finger in water and cool my tongue; for I am tormented in this flame.' 25 BUT ABRAHAM SAID, 'Son, remember that in your lifetime you received your good things, and likewise Lazarus evil things; but NOW HE IS COMFORTED AND YOU ARE TORMENTED. 26 And besides all this, between us and you there is a great gulf fixed, so that those who want to pass from here to you cannot, nor can those from there pass to us.' 27 "Then he said, 'I beg you therefore, father, that you would send him to my father's house, 28 for I have five brothers, that he may testify to them, lest they also come to this place of torment.' 29 Abraham said to him, 'They have Moses and the prophets; let them hear them.' 30 And he said, 'No, father Abraham; but IF ONE GOES TO THEM FROM THE DEAD, they will repent.' 31 But he said to him, 'If they do not hear Moses and the prophets, NEITHER WILL THEY BE PERSUADED THOUGH ONE RISE FROM THE DEAD.' "

This is NOT a parable. It is an actual, reliable story that Jesus is telling about men who categorically lived on the earth and what happened to them immediately upon death. No soul sleep. No parable ever mentions the names of people, especially historical people, such as Abraham. The rich man, Lazarus and Abraham all had CONSCIOUS, THINKING, SPEAKING SOULS AND SPIRITS - as do the people mentioned in the following passages of Scripture:

The ongoing life of the soul...



Genesis 35:18 And so it was, as her [Rachel's] SOUL was departing [her body] (for she died), that she called his name Ben-Oni; but his father called him Benjamin.

1 Kings 17:21-22 And he stretched himself out on the child three times, and cried out to the Lord and said, "O Lord my God, I pray, let this child's SOUL come back to him." 22 Then the Lord heard the voice of Elijah; and THE SOUL of the child came back to him, and he revived.

1 Samuel 28:3-19 Now Samuel had died, and all Israel had lamented for him and buried him in Ramah, in his own city. And Saul had put the mediums and the spiritists out of the land.

4 Then the Philistines gathered together, and came and encamped at Shunem. So Saul gathered all Israel together, and they encamped at Gilboa. 5 When Saul saw the army of the Philistines, he was afraid, and his heart trembled greatly. 6 And when Saul inquired of the LORD, the LORD did not answer him, either by dreams or by Urim or by the prophets.

7 Then Saul said to his servants, "Find me a woman who is a medium, that I may go to her and inquire of her."

And his servants said to him, "In fact, there is a woman who is a medium at En Dor."

8 So Saul disguised himself and put on other clothes, and he went, and two men with him; and they came to the woman by night. And he said, "Please conduct a séance for me, and bring up for me the one I shall name to you."

9 Then the woman said to him, "Look, you know what Saul has done, how he has cut off the mediums and the spiritists from the land. Why then do you lay a snare for my life, to cause me to die?"

10 And Saul swore to her by the LORD, saying, "As the LORD lives, no punishment shall come upon you for this thing."

11 Then the woman said, "Whom shall I bring up for you?"

And he said, "Bring up Samuel for me."

12 When the woman saw Samuel, she cried out with a loud voice. And the woman spoke to Saul, saying, "Why have you deceived me? For you are Saul!"

13 And the king said to her, "Do not be afraid. What did you see?"

And the woman said to Saul, "I saw a spirit ascending out of the earth."

14 So he said to her, "What is his form?"

And she said, "An old man is coming up, and he is covered with a mantle." And Saul perceived that it was Samuel, and he stooped with his face to the ground and bowed down.

15 Now Samuel said to Saul, "Why have you disturbed me by bringing me up?"

And Saul answered, “I am deeply distressed; for the Philistines make war against me, and God has departed from me and does not answer me anymore, neither by prophets nor by dreams. Therefore, I have called you, that you may reveal to me what I should do.”

16 Then Samuel said: “So why do you ask me, seeing the LORD has departed from you and has become your enemy? 17 And the LORD has done for Himself as He spoke by me. For the LORD has torn the kingdom out of your hand and given it to your neighbor, David. 18 Because you did not obey the voice of the LORD nor execute His fierce wrath upon Amalek, therefore the LORD has done this thing to you this day. 19 Moreover the LORD will also deliver Israel with you into the hand of the Philistines. And tomorrow you and your sons will be with me. The LORD will also deliver the army of Israel into the hand of the Philistines.”

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema David Alesso Again thanks. I am headed out with my wife to eat. Will be back in a couple of hours. I am going to email some theologians I know and get their take on the issue. I will let you know if my argument continues to appear valid.

1

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 1d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Lee Attema Matthew 17:1-13 Now after six days Jesus took Peter, James, and John his brother, led them up on a high mountain by themselves; 2 and He was transfigured before them. His face shone like the sun, and His clothes became as white as the light.

3 And behold, >>>Moses and Elijah appeared [Strong’s number: 3708 ὄφθη, ōphthē - to see, perceive, attend to, look upon, experience – see also Luke 24:34; Acts 7:26; 1 Corinthians 15:5-8; 1 Timothy 3:16] to them, talking with Him [Jesus].<<<

4 Then Peter answered and said to Jesus, “Lord, it is good for us to be here; if You wish, let us make here three tabernacles: one for You, one for Moses, and one for Elijah.”

5 While he was still speaking, behold, a bright cloud overshadowed them; and suddenly a voice came out of the cloud, saying, “This is My beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased. Hear Him!”

6 And when the disciples heard it, they fell on their faces and were greatly afraid. 7 But Jesus

came and touched them and said, “Arise, and do not be afraid.” 8 When they had lifted up their eyes, they saw no one but Jesus only.

9 Now as they came down from the mountain, Jesus commanded them, saying, “Tell the vision [Strong’s number: 3705 ὄραμα, horama - a spectacle, vision, spiritual seeing, that which is seen (used 12 times in the NT)] to no one until the Son of Man is risen from the dead.”

10 And His disciples asked Him, saying, “Why then do the scribes say that Elijah must come first?”

11 Jesus answered and said to them, “Indeed, Elijah is coming first and will restore all things. 12 But I say to you that Elijah has come already, and they did not know him but did to him whatever they wished. Likewise the Son of Man is also about to suffer at their hands.” 13 Then the disciples understood that He spoke to them of John the Baptist.

<https://biblehub.com/greek/3705.htm>

<https://biblehub.com/interlinear/matthew/17.htm>

Body - Strong’s number: 4983 Greek σῶμα, sōma – the physical body, flesh; the body of the Church. also used figuratively of the mystical Body of Christ the Church, the one people of God).

Strong’s number: 1320 Hebrew בָּשָׂר, basar – flesh, body

Soul - Strong’s number: 5590 Greek ψυχῆ, psychē - (a) the vital breath, breath of life, (b) the human soul, (c) the soul as the seat of affections and will, (d) the self, (e) a human person, an individual. a person’s distinct identity (unique personhood), i.e. individual personality.

Strong’s number: 5315 Hebrew נֶפֶשׁ, nephesh - a soul, living being, life, self, person, desire, passion, appetite, emotion

Spirit - Strong’s number: 4151 Greek πνεῦμα, pneuma - wind, breath, spirit. Only the context determines which sense(s) is meant.

Strong’s number: 7307 Hebrew רוּחַ, ruach - breath, wind, spirit - it departs at death: Psalm 78:39 (Dr a wind that passeth away 2e); Isaiah 38:16 (Di principle of life), Psalm 146:4; especially Psalm 104:29; Psalm 104:30; Job 17:1; Job 34:14 (compare Job 34:15), Isaiah 57:16; Ecclesiastes 8:8 (twice in verse) (wind Wild); Ecclesiastes 11:5, compare Ecclesiastes 3:21; over ag. Ecclesiastes 12:7; Psalm 31:6. as sign and symbol of life: Genesis 6:17; Genesis 7:15 (P); Genesis 7:22 (P); Ezekiel 37:5, compare Ezekiel 37:6; Ezekiel 37:8; Ezekiel 37:9; Ezekiel 37:9; Ezekiel 37:9; Ezekiel 37:10; Ezekiel 37:14 (breath or spirit), Ecclesiastes 3:19

[https://biblehub.com/interlinear/1\\_thessalonians/5.htm](https://biblehub.com/interlinear/1_thessalonians/5.htm)

Hide or report this

Strong's Greek: 3705. ὄραμα (horama) -- that which is seen

BIBLEHUB.COM

Strong's Greek: 3705. ὄραμα (horama) -- that which is seen

Strong's Greek: 3705. ὄραμα (horama) -- that which is seen

1

Like

· Reply · 1d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema David Alesso Yes I think there is excellent evidence that our soul, that which we identify as "me" continues after death.

2

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 1d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Lee Attema You're welcome again. Enjoy your lunch (or dinner) with your wife!

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams Excellent David Alesso, I would add Hebrews 4:12 about man being three parts, and Philippians 3:20-21 about our bodies being changed like his (Jesus' ) glorious body, 1 John 3:2; 1 Thessalonians 4:13-18; and how our resurrection bodies will be raised incorruptible and immortal, 1 Corinthians 15:51-57, KJV. You David use all the same Scriptures that I use. One correction, no one ascended to heaven until after Jesus did, there were two parts in hades the righteous side, and for the unrighteous, Luke 16:19-31 called Abraham's bosom or Paradise, today, Paradise is in the third heaven.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams Luke 16:22-31, KJV Read it in context of 1-31.

22 And it came to pass, that the beggar died, and was carried by the angels into Abraham's bosom: the rich man also died, and was buried;

23 And in hell he lift up his eyes, being in torments, and seeth Abraham afar off, and Lazarus in his bosom.

24 And he cried and said, Father Abraham, have mercy on me, and send Lazarus, that he may dip the tip of his finger in water, and cool my tongue; for I am tormented in this flame.

25 But Abraham said, Son, remember that thou in thy lifetime receivedst thy good things, and likewise Lazarus evil things: but now he is comforted, and thou art tormented.

26 And beside all this, between us and you there is a great gulf fixed: so that they which would pass from hence to you cannot; neither can they pass to us, that would come from thence.

27 Then he said, I pray thee therefore, father, that thou wouldest send him to my father's house:

28 For I have five brethren; that he may testify unto them, lest they also come into this place of torment.

29 Abraham saith unto him, They have Moses and the prophets; let them hear them.

30 And he said, Nay, father Abraham: but if one went unto them from the dead, they will repent.

31 And he said unto him, If they hear not Moses and the prophets, neither will they be persuaded, though one rose from the dead.

King James Version (KJV)

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams Hebrews 4:12, KJV

12 For the word of God is quick, and powerful, and sharper than any twoedged sword, piercing even to the dividing asunder of soul and spirit, and of the joints and marrow, and is a discernor of the thoughts and intents of the heart.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams Ephesians 4:8-10 King James Version (KJV)

8 Wherefore he saith, When he ascended up on high, he led captivity captive, and gave gifts unto men.

9 (Now that he ascended, what is it but that he also descended first into the lower parts of the earth?)

10 He that descended is the same also that ascended up far above all heavens, that he might fill all things.)

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams 2 Corinthians 12:1-4 King James Version (KJV)

12 It is not expedient for me doubtless to glory. I will come to visions and revelations of the Lord.

2 I knew a man in Christ above fourteen years ago, (whether in the body, I cannot tell; or whether out of the body, I cannot tell: God knoweth;) such an one caught up to the third heaven.

3 And I knew such a man, (whether in the body, or out of the body, I cannot tell: God knoweth;)

4 How that he was caught up into paradise, and heard unspeakable words, which it is not lawful for a man to utter.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams Philippians 3:20-21

20 For our conversation is in heaven; from whence also we look for the Saviour, the Lord Jesus Christ:

21 Who shall change our vile body, that it may be fashioned like unto his glorious body, according to the working whereby he is able even to subdue all things unto himself.

King James Version (KJV)

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams 1 John 3:2, KJV

Beloved, now are we the sons of God, and it doth not yet appear what we shall be: but we know that, when he shall appear, we shall be like him; for we shall see him as he is.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams 1 Thessalonians 4:13-18 King James Version (KJV)

13 But I would not have you to be ignorant, brethren, concerning them which are asleep, that ye sorrow not, even as others which have no hope.

14 For if we believe that Jesus died and rose again, even so them also which sleep in Jesus will God bring with him.

15 For this we say unto you by the word of the Lord, that we which are alive and remain unto the coming of the Lord shall not prevent them which are asleep.

16 For the Lord himself shall descend from heaven with a shout, with the voice of the archangel, and with the trump of God: and the dead in Christ shall rise first:

17 Then we which are alive and remain shall be caught up together with them in the clouds, to meet the Lord in the air: and so shall we ever be with the Lord.

18 Wherefore comfort one another with these words.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Sharon Jessie Williams

Sharon Jessie Williams 1 Corinthians 15:51-57, KJV

51 Behold, I shew you a mystery; We shall not all sleep, but we shall all be changed,

52 In a moment, in the twinkling of an eye, at the last trump: for the trumpet shall sound, and the dead shall be raised incorruptible, and we shall be changed.

53 For this corruptible must put on incorruption, and this mortal must put on immortality.

54 So when this corruptible shall have put on incorruption, and this mortal shall have put on immortality, then shall be brought to pass the saying that is written, Death is swallowed up in victory.

55 O death, where is thy sting? O grave, where is thy victory?

56 The sting of death is sin; and the strength of sin is the law.

57 But thanks be to God, which giveth us the victory through our Lord Jesus Christ.

2

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Sharon Jessie Williams Thank you and excellent on your part!

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 22h

Lee Attema

Write a reply...

David Allan

David Allan I agree. If one creates a perfect replica of a glass with the same molecular structure, same chips and scratches, looking exactly the same, where it can function with exactly the same capacity, that will never make the glass the same thing, but only ever a replica. Even if a perfect one at that.



In fact, I would go even further to this flawed thinking and point out a few other Biblical problems that are created through this approach (I've used capital letters in the Scripture texts to highlight the verses in question):

1. it puts JW's in line with the Sadducees who didn't believe in the afterlife (supernatural), and Jesus answered them by saying that they didn't know what the Scriptures actually taught (Mark 12:26-27). Then Jesus proceeded to teach that when Moses met YHWH at the burning bush, that YHWH used the present tense verb, "I am (I am the God of Abraham, etc.)," saying YHWH was the God of the living because although Abraham, Isaac and Jacob had been dead some 400 years at the time of Moses, they were living at that present time, because God is the God of the living.

2. If the Word in John 1:1 becomes flesh in John 1:14 - which John clearly teaches, and in the beginning before coming to earth (John 1:1) he is Michael the Archangel who goes out of existence when he becomes Jesus the man - how could it be stated accurately in John 1:14 that the actual Word (He who was in the beginning with the Father) became flesh? It can't! According to JW's theology, the Word in the beginning with the Father, ceased to exist when he became a man (another reason the Word could not be Michael).

3. Furthermore, this whole thinking leaches into the teaching on the resurrection of Jesus. When Jesus said in John 2:19, "Destroy this temple, and in three days I will raise it up," how else is this to be interpreted, but that the actual body of Jesus would be resurrected. Especially in light of John 2:21, "But he was speaking about the temple of his body." Jesus said, "Destroy THIS TEMPLE... and I will raise IT UP." He clearly taught that he would not raise up another temple. Also in order for Him to raise it, he must have been in conscious existence, which lines up with what he said to the thief on the cross with him in Luke 23:43, "And he said to him, "Truly, I say to you, today you will be with me in paradise."

This also lines up with Paul's point on the resurrection body having continuity from the mortal body we now have.

In 1 Cor 15:35-38. Paul states:

"35 But someone will ask, "How are the dead raised? With what kind of body do they come?" 36 You foolish person! What you sow does not come to life unless it dies. 37 And what you sow is not the body that is to be, but a bare kernel, perhaps of wheat or of some other grain. 38 But God gives it a body as he has chosen, and to EACH KIND OF SEED ITS OWN BODY."

Paul clearly teaches here that the seed determines the type of plant, showing continuity from the seed (Kernel to the plant). If a kernel of wheat is sown it produces a wheat stalk, not a barley stalk because the seed has continuity with the stalk. Hence the mortal body has continuity with the spiritual body that will be raised, yet the kernel dies and is no longer seen, but is necessary for the stalk to be produced.

Hence he says in 1 Cor 15:44, "It is sown a natural body; it is raised a spiritual body." But it is from that same body that the spiritual body is raised - not another replica.

Hide or report this

Love

· Reply · 2d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso You bring up many excellent points that cannot be rebutted, David Allan!

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Larry Madigan

Larry Madigan Excellent. The seed sown turns into the plant, it is not a copy of that seed sown that turns into the mature plant. It is the exact same seed planted.

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Brian Pope

Brian Pope The Watchtower view is more like cloning and reincarnation than biblical resurrection.

4

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema So where this seems to go, if I am correct is that the promise given to the "great crowd" is false. They will never see the new paradise earth. Their copy may, but they will not.

4

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema Thanks for the input of those who answered. I am still thinking about this and its potential ramifications. I welcome any further comments or any links that you may have. Feel free to PM me in regard to this.

1

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 2d

Diane Allen

Diane Allen At my JW FiL's funeral, they said that everyone was looking forward to seeing him again. He WOULDN'T LOOK THE SAME but we will know it is him. Creepy or what??

2

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 2d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Diane Allen That's a lot different from when Peter, James and John accompanied Jesus up onto what we call the Mount of Transfiguration in Matthew `17, and - although they had never seen Moses and Elijah - Peter, James and John recognized them.

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Diane Allen

Diane Allen David Alesso yet the pictures the WT publish are of families being reunited at the graveside. How will you know who they are if they don't look the same? Only when they start reminiscing about your life together will you realise that this strange looking person is now your loved one!!

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d · Edited

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Diane Allen You make a very good point. But do they believe they will know things - good and bad - from their previous lives?

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Diane Allen

Diane Allen David Alesso who knows. If you start asking the more practical questions they can't/won't answer.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Diane Allen That is true. JW's are taught to focus on reading and learning just certain passages of Scripture and most don't read any more than that because they have so much other Watchtower material to read every week.

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Diane Allen

Diane Allen David Alesso That, of course, is the 'keep them busy' routine. Don't give anyone time to think too hard about it all. The practicalities of seeing loved ones again are insurmountable imo

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

David AlessoActive Now

David Alesso Diane Allen you are so right, unfortunately for them.

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Lee Attema

Write a reply...

Mark Griffin

Mark Griffin I agree. I consider it closer to reincarnation than resurrection. They have no pattern. Even their Christ doesn't have his original body. Not only that, but Jesus and/or God lied to Thomas when Thomas wanted to see the holes in Jesus. It really wasn't Jesus, but some borrowed mutilated body. see the link. Paragraphs 9-10

<https://wol.jw.org/en/wol/d/r1/lp-e/1101989107#h=33>

Hide or report this

WOL.JW.ORG

Christ's Return—How Seen? — Watchtower ONLINE LIBRARY

Christ's Return—How Seen? — Watchtower ONLINE LIBRARY

1

Like

· Reply · 1d

Mark Griffin

Mark Griffin Do JWs respond to posts in this group? Or do they just look and ignore?

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Fred Shaw

Fred Shaw Mark Griffin : Very seldom do we ever get a response from any JW. They seem to ignore any direct questions and all we end up getting is a series of contributions from Christians, as you can clearly see from the comments on this meme.

3

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Randy Mabused

Randy Mabused It took me awhile to comprehend what you are asking. Great question.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Lee Attema

Lee Attema It is a difficult question. One reply from a theologian dismisses the claim saying God, being God, can do anything. And that seems to make sense except God cannot do the illogical. (Make a four sided triangle etc.) The JW's are bodily materialist and for them the mind is the brain. So when the brain dies its activity perishes. Anything that is recreated is by definition (I think) a copy. The original is gone. If that is so, the "me" portion of the person has perished and been replaced. So the resurrected person is not, cannot be the original person but is a copy. Feel free to comment. I wrestle daily with this as I am looking for the pro and con side.

1

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 1d

Randy Mabused

Randy Mabused Lee Attema but a four sided triangle is only illogical in our dimension. Lol

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 23h

Lee Attema

Lee Attema Randy Mabused Yes but it is the only one I get to live in.

1

Edit or delete this

Like

· Reply · 23h

Lee Attema

Write a reply...

Bridget Christine AndersonActive Now

Bridget Christine Anderson Interesting analogy with your computer!

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 21h

Jay Hess

Jay Hess I once asked my JW son about the resurrection. I asked if he died in this life faithful who would live out eternity in the New System? Would it be him or a copy? He knew it would be a copy/clone. But then he answered that this clone would 'think' that he was the real thing and go about eternal life that way. Then I asked if in the New System would he be taught WT theology, including that resurrected people were really copies? ... "Oh ... right." ... So the clone would know that he was only a copy. ... Sux to think that you were loyal and faithful but someone else was living out your reward.

3

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 15h

Mark Griffin

Mark Griffin It's actually living a lie. Their god is perpetrating a lie by making a copy and making people believe it's really their own body from the previous life. The whole thing is Satanic to the first degree. Outright denying the resurrection.

1

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply · 14h

Mark Griffin

Mark Griffin Sylvia J Smith Atheists up above

Hide or report this

Like

· Reply ·



## ARTICLE 6

### Beyond The Grave

Written by John Carson

Jehovah's Witnesses (JWs) do not believe Jesus Christ raised His own body from the dead. The Watchtower Bible and Tract Society (WT) teaches:

“After Jesus died, he was in the tomb for about three days.... Since he was dead, he could not resurrect himself.... (Jesus) was nonexistent for about three days.” (Watchtower Magazine - June 1, 1988)

A JW might point to Ecclesiastes 9 for support of their WT doctrine. They teach:

“When a person dies, he ceases to exist. Death is the opposite of life. The dead do not see or hear or think. Not even one part of us survives the death of the body. We do not possess an immortal soul or spirit.... The Bible teaches that “the dead know nothing at all.” (Ecclesiastes 9:5) They are not alive and have no conscious existence anywhere.” (What Does the Bible Really Teach?, chapters 6 and 7)

How JWs view Jesus Christ's resurrection is directly connected to how they view his nature. Since JWs believe Jesus was human, and not God, they say he must have ceased to exist while his body was in the tomb. They believe he could not have had any capability of raising himself from the dead.

There are two major points to their thinking:

Jesus cannot be God.

The dead have no conscious existence anywhere.

A JW elder asked me a question that brought us to a discussion about these two points:

“Since God cannot die, and Jesus died, how could he be God?”

Having knowledge of his doctrinal position was helpful in answering that question. If Jesus is not God, then he would have had to rely on a power greater than himself for his resurrection.... and, if the dead have no conscious existence, how could Jesus make the decision to raise himself up from the dead? So I decided to just get right to the point he was trying to make:

“If Jesus ceased to exist, then He obviously cannot be God.”

He responded back with a victory smile:

“Well then, there you have it.”

I quickly added:

“Oh, I don’t believe Jesus ceased to exist at all. Remember what happened just before Jesus died? He called out with a loud voice, “Father, into your hands I commit my spirit (see Luke 23:46)”. I believe His spirit lived on, and so the Father and Jesus immediately continued their intimate bond they had always enjoyed from all eternity with each Other.

[Note: JWs may try to argue that the word spirit (pneuma in Greek) in Luke 23:46 merely refers to Jesus breathing out his last breath. Thereby they do not believe this means his spirit continued to exist. However, when cross referenced with John 19:30, He used a phrase which in Greek means, “to hand over, or deliver up, or commit.... His spirit.” Also, have your JW friend look up 1 Thessalonians 5:23, “May the God of peace himself sanctify you wholly; and may your spirit (pneuma - same word Jesus used), and soul and body be kept sound and blameless at the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ.” Ask: “Am I to understand from this same Greek word for spirit, pneuma, that Paul was saying I am to keep my breathing blameless?”]

His response was abrupt and stern:

“Jesus was dead! The dead can do nothing! If you’re dead, you’re dead! Who do you think raised Jesus from the dead?! He obviously had to rely on a power greater than himself since he was dead!”

I shared John 2:18-22 with him (Jesus said very plainly there that He would raise His own body). I was told that Jesus didn’t really mean what He said and that the Book of Ecclesiastes proves it was impossible for Jesus to raise himself from the dead. Another JW he brought along asked me:

“If Ecclesiastes teaches the conscience dies with the body, how could Jesus perform the miracle of His own resurrection? How do you explain Jesus bringing himself back to life if Ecclesiastes 9:10 says ....there is no work nor planning nor knowledge nor wisdom in the Grave?”

They also used verse 5, which reads in their New World Translation (NWT):

“.... the dead know nothing at all.”

From their understanding of these verses, they believe Jesus could not really mean that He would literally raise His own body because it was impossible for him to be active; I told them I believe Jesus did mean what He said, as did His disciples (see John 2:22). I challenged them:

“If Ecclesiastes teaches Jesus became nonexistent upon His death, then I can understand how you see a contradiction with Him meaning He would really raise Himself. But if Jesus did mean what He said, then Solomon, who wrote Ecclesiastes, must have been mistaken.”

They both responded with:

“Scripture cannot contradict Scripture!”

I said:

“I absolutely agree with you. Then the fault must lie with how individuals interpret Scripture passages, and not with the Scriptures. If Jesus did mean what He said in John 2, then Ecclesiastes 9 cannot be teaching that He ceased to exist.”

Let’s take a look at Ecclesiastes 9 and examine what it is teaching. To get a proper understanding of what Solomon was talking about, we need to first consider the context of this book.

There’s an interesting phrase that is repeated often in the Book of Ecclesiastes, “what is done under the sun” (Ecclesiastes 9:6). Anything that is done under the sun, is synonymous to whatever is done in the physical realm. “Under the sun” is a Hebraic idiom for “in the physical world” without God. It is so significant that Solomon used this phrase 29 times throughout this book.

[To see how fitting this connotation is, I recorded the verses and replaced the phrase “under the sun” with “in the physical world”. Due to its length, these list of verses can be viewed by the interested reader at the bottom of this article.]

A careful reading of Ecclesiastes reveals Solomon was talking about how everything is meaningless without God; that all our striving in the physical world without Him will come to an end; that

“.... all the things that are done under the sun; all of them are meaningless, a chasing after the wind.” (Ecclesiastes 1:14)

This is in contrast for the things that are done under Christ’s authority and power. Jesus said,

“Truly I tell you, anyone who gives you a cup of water in my name because you belong to the Messiah will certainly not lose their reward.” (Mark 9:41)

Ecclesiastes 1:14 teaches:

Everything done “under the sun” is meaningless.

Yet Mark 9:41 teaches:

Everything done “under the Son” is meaningful.

The contrast is clear. The Book of Ecclesiastes is a book of wisdom Solomon wrote, that deals mainly with the vanity of all the striving performed in the physical world in the attempt to find meaning without God. All of it results in meaninglessness. It is not until the final chapter does he state:

“Remember your Creator in the days of your youth, before the days of trouble come and the years approach when you will say, “I find no pleasure in them.”” (Ecclesiastes 12:1).

So we get an overall picture of what Solomon was teaching. It is a fabulous book that is worth spending time studying. But what about this WT doctrine that the dead ceases to exist? Let’s take a look at Ecclesiastes 9:4. It gives us a quick hint of what Solomon was talking about in this chapter:

“A live dog is better off than a dead lion!”

Solomon uses the example of the value of physical life versus physical death of animals. By using this example, he was talking about earthly existence, not spiritual destinies. Animals and humans share a common destiny within the physical realm — physical death. This is consistent with what he wrote in Ecclesiastes 3:19-20:

“Surely the fate of human beings is like that of the animals; the same fate awaits them both: As one dies, so dies the other. All have the same breath; humans have no advantage over animals. Everything is meaningless. All go to the same place; all come from dust, and to dust all return.”

Where do their bodies return to? To the dust of the earth. There is no mention of heaven because Solomon was dealing with everything that happens in the physical realm. These verses are simply calling attention to the fact that as far as our earthly existence is concerned, we have no advantage over the beasts in regards to physical death.

The WT quote at the top of this article claims Ecclesiastes is teaching:

“(The dead) are not alive and have no conscious existence anywhere.” (What Does the Bible Really Teach?, chapter 7)

A more accurate and consistent statement would have been:



“(The dead) have no conscious existence here on earth, in the Grave.”

The word “Grave” was so troublesome, that the WT even went so far as to redefine it to fit their doctrine. They teach “the Grave” is:

“... a symbolic place or condition where any consciousness or activity ceases.” (Watchtower Magazine, August 1, 2015)

Nowhere in Ecclesiastes does Solomon call “the Grave” a condition or a symbolic place. It is an actual physical place where we bury our dead. This is an important point that should not be missed. Consider the dog and the lion. Why is a living dog better off than a dead lion (Ecclesiastes 9:4)? Because the lion can no longer make the majestic sound of a mighty roar. So also, all the vain striving we do without God, no matter how majestic it may seem, will all come to an abrupt end at death. By using the example of animals, Solomon was not teaching a person ceases to exist at the point of death, but to warn us where vain striving without God leads to. All of it ends in the Grave. All of it is meaningless.

So when we read “there is no work nor planning nor knowledge nor wisdom in the Grave, where you are going (Ecclesiastes 9:10)”, Solomon is simply talking about the physical place of burial.

To use Ecclesiastes to teach that Jesus ceased to exist for the three days while his body was in the tomb, is a demonstration of using isolated verses while disregarding context. Solomon wasn't even dealing with the topic. His warnings were about relying on what is done within the physical realm without God.

God's Word is clear!

“For I am convinced that neither death, nor life, nor angels, nor principalities, nor things present, nor things to come, nor powers, nor height, nor depth, nor any other created thing, will be able to separate us from the love of God, which is in Christ Jesus our Lord.”

Romans 8:38-39

It is only in Jesus Christ where you find eternal life (read 1 John 5:11-12). God's promise is that nothing that is to come... not even death... can cause those who belong to Christ to be separated from God's love. We can enjoy a continuous and uninterrupted love relationship with God through the Lord Jesus Christ. “Where, oh death, is your sting?” (1 Corinthians 15:55) Death can do nothing!

Here are a few Scripture passage to consider. Read....

John 2:18-22 and 10:17-18, where Jesus said He would resurrect His own body

Matthew 17:1-4, where Moses and Elijah appeared alive with Jesus

Luke 16:19-31, where Jesus taught the parable of Lazarus and the rich man

Luke 20:37-38, where Jesus said God is not the God of the dead, but of the living

Philippians 1:21-24, where Paul said when he dies he will be with Christ

2 Samuel 12:16-23, where David said he will go to be with his departed child

The following is a list of verses I took from Ecclesiastes. The 29 times Solomon used the phrase “under the sun” is replaced with “in the physical world” in order to demonstrate how this connotation is fitting:

1:3 What advantage does man have in all his work Which he does [in the physical world]?

1:9 That which has been is that which will be, And that which has been done is that which will be done. So there is nothing new [in the physical world].

1:14 I have seen all the works which have been done [in the physical world], and behold, all is vanity and striving after wind.

2:11 Thus I considered all my activities which my hands had done and the labor which I had exerted, and behold all was vanity and striving after wind and there was no profit [in the physical world].

2:17 So I hated life, for the work which had been done [in the physical world] was grievous to me; because everything is futility and striving after wind.

2:18 [ The Futility of Labor ] Thus I hated all the fruit of my labor for which I had labored [in the physical world], for I must leave it to the man who will come after me.

2:19 And who knows whether he will be a wise man or a fool? Yet he will have control over all the fruit of my labor for which I have labored by acting wisely [in the physical world]. This too is vanity.”

2:20 Therefore I completely despaired of all the fruit of my labor for which I had labored [in the physical world].

2:22 For what does a man get in all his labor and in his striving with which he labors [in the physical world]?

3:16 Furthermore, I have seen [in the physical world] that in the place of justice there is wickedness and in the place of righteousness there is wickedness.

4:1 [ The Evils of Oppression ] Then I looked again at all the acts of oppression which were being done [in the physical world]. And behold I saw the tears of the oppressed and that they had no one to comfort them; and on the side of their oppressors was power, but they had no one to comfort them.

4:3 But better off than both of them is the one who has never existed, who has never seen the evil activity that is done [in the physical world].

4:7-8 Then I looked again at vanity [in the physical world]. 8 There was a certain man without a dependent, having neither a son nor a brother, yet there was no end to all his labor. Indeed, his eyes were not satisfied with riches and he never asked, “And for whom am I laboring and depriving myself of pleasure?” This too is vanity and it is a grievous task.

4:15 I have seen all the living [in the physical world] throng to the side of the second lad who replaces him.

5:13 There is a grievous evil which I have seen [in the physical world]: riches being hoarded by their owner to his hurt.

5:18 Here is what I have seen to be good and fitting: to eat, to drink and enjoy oneself in all one's labor in which he toils [in the physical world] during the few years of his life which God has given him; for this is his reward.

6:1 [ The Futility of Life ] There is an evil which I have seen [in the physical world] and it is prevalent among men—

6:12 For who knows what is good for a man during his lifetime, during the few years of his futile life? He will spend them like a shadow. For who can tell a man what will be after him [in the physical world]?

8:9 All this I have seen and applied my mind to every deed that has been done [in the physical world] wherein a man has exercised authority over another man to his hurt.

8:15 So I commended pleasure, for there is nothing good for a man [in the physical world] except to eat and to drink and to be merry, and this will stand by him in his toils throughout the days of his life which God has given him [in the physical world].

8:17 and I saw every work of God, I concluded that man cannot discover the work which has been done [in the physical world]. Even though man should seek laboriously, he will not discover; and though the wise man should say, "I know," he cannot discover.

9:3 This is an evil in all that is done [in the physical world], that there is one fate for all men. Furthermore, the hearts of the sons of men are full of evil and insanity is in their hearts throughout their lives. Afterwards they go to the dead.

9:6 Indeed their love, their hate and their zeal have already perished, and they will no longer have a share in all that is done [in the physical world].

9:9 Enjoy life with the woman whom you love all the days of your fleeting life which He has given to you [in the physical world]; for this is your reward in life and in your toil in which you have labored [in the physical world].

9:11 I again saw [in the physical world] that the race is not to the swift and the battle is not to the warriors, and neither is bread to the wise nor wealth to the discerning nor favor to men of ability; for time and chance overtake them all.

9:13-17 Also this I came to see as wisdom [in the physical world], and it impressed me. 14 There was a small city with few men in it and a great king came to it, surrounded it and constructed large siegeworks against it. 15 But there was found in it a poor wise man and he delivered the city by his wisdom. Yet no one remembered that poor man. 16 So I said, "Wisdom is better than

strength.” But the wisdom of the poor man is despised and his words are not heeded. 17 The words of the wise heard in quietness are better than the shouting of a ruler among fools. 18 Wisdom is better than weapons of war, but one sinner destroys much good.

10:5 There is an evil I have seen [in the physical world], like an error which goes forth from the ruler.

Ecclesiastes forces us to ask, “What meaning does life really have here on earth without God?” The answer is grim. The solution however, is found in a relationship with Jesus Christ, who is Emmanuel.... God with us. Seek the LORD while He may be found; Call upon Him while He is near (Isaiah 55:6).

## ARTICLE 7

### Soul Sleep

In the interest of transparency, I am not a JW. I have done some research into the topic. Many years ago, I was affiliated with the Advent Christian denomination from whom the JWs borrowed several doctrines. Soul sleep was one of them. I do not currently support the concept of “soul sleep” as it appears to create too many contradictions. I do, however, hold a minority position referred to as conditional immortality. Otherwise, my beliefs would likely be described as traditional conservative theology. Always feel free to message me as I enjoy ongoing conversation.

The founder of the Watchtower, Charles Taze Russell, wanted to develop a belief system that was rational and reasonable. As a result, he tended to dismiss many of the doctrines held by the traditional church, such as the trinity and hell. Because of this he taught that the soul did not survive death, it would be resurrected (recreated) at the time of the resurrection. However, over time the Watchtower has developed a two-tier eschatology. The anointed, all 144,000 of them, at death are immediately given a resurrection body and they go to heaven to work with Jesus (Michael?). The vast majority of people without a “heavenly hope” expect to have a different experience. They believe that man is not natively immortal and that when the totally impersonal spirit of life, is taken back by God the soul ceases to exist. This is because the soul is said to be the result of the interaction between the spirit of life and the material body. Death is a complete dissolution. The spirit returns to God and the body rots. The soul ceases to exist as soon as the spirit was gone. At the resurrection the soul will be recreated by God and will live in Paradise. This creates an interesting question. Is this new soul the “same” soul that perished or is it a clone, like a copied computer program. At the resurrection are the resurrected the “same” people that died or are they a copy and therefore not the “same” people?

Below are quotes from JW sources that support my understanding of their theology. I have not made an effort to point out the errors or to correct the faulty theology.

- Jehovah’s Witnesses do not believe the soul is immortal. (Immortality) “It is based upon the unscriptural theory that God created man immortal, that he cannot cease to exist, and that God cannot destroy him ; hence the argument is that the incorrigible must live on somewhere and somehow, and the conclusion is that since they are out of harmony with God their eternity must be one of misery. But God's Word assures us that he has provided against such a perpetuation of sin and sinners: that man is mortal, and that the full penalty of willful sin against full light and knowledge will not be a life in torment, but a second death. \*"The soul that sinneth, it shall die.” They believe that at the time of death a person loses all awareness and ceases to exist. Figuratively they sleep. [Charles Taze Russell, *Millennial Dawn*, vol. 2, *The Time Is at Hand* (Allegheny, PA: Watchtower Bible and Tract Society, 1889), 99-101, accessed August 5, 2018, <http://www.watchtowerwayback.org/jw->

wb/English/Books/Teachings/1889%20Studies%20in%20the%20Scriptures%20Vol2-The%20Time%20Is%20At%20Hand%20(1st%20edition).pdf.]

- In regard to man, there is a concern to understand the spirit as an impersonal life force that is given by God and returned to Him. The soul is the result of the union of the spirit and the material body. Looking at the language they state: “The Hebrew and Greek words translated “spirit” in the English edition of the New World Translation can mean different things. Yet they always refer to something invisible to humans, such as the wind or the breath of humans and animals. These words may also refer to spirit persons and to the holy spirit, which is God’s active force. The Bible does not teach that a separate part of a person keeps on living after he dies.”—Exodus 35:21; Psalm 104:29; Matthew 12:43; Luke 11:13. See Chap. 6, par. 5; Chap. 15, par. 17  
[<https://www.jw.org/en/library/books/bible-study/glossary/#p57-p66>]
- They further expand on this idea stating: “Humans are made from dust. (Genesis 2:7; 3:19) We are not spirits living in a body of flesh. We are physical creatures, so no part of us survives death. When we die, our brain dies too, and our thoughts perish. Thus, Lazarus said nothing about his experience of death because the dead are unconscious.”—Read Psalm 146:4; Ecclesiastes 9:5, 6, 10.[<https://www.jw.org/en/library/books/good-news-from-god/what-hope-for-the-dead/>]
- They teach at death we cease to exist: “Adam chose to ignore God’s warning. He sinned when he disobeyed God, so he died. (Romans 6:23) No part of Adam survived his death. Rather, at death Adam ceased to exist. God said to Adam: “In the sweat of your face you will eat bread until you return to the ground, for out of it you were taken. For dust you are and to dust you will return.” (Genesis 3:19) Because all mankind descended from Adam, we inherited sin and death from him.”—Romans 5:12.
- Jesus did not agree with the religious leaders of his day who said that there would be no resurrection of the dead. (Luke 20:27) Neither did he teach that some part of a person survives death. [<https://www.jw.org/en/library/magazines/wp20121101/what-happens-when-you-die/>]
- Jehovah’s Witnesses teach that the brain is the seat of awareness and nothing survives death. “4 Such religious teachings all share one basic idea—that some part of us survives the death of the physical body. According to almost every religion, past and present, we somehow live on forever with the ability to see, hear, and think. Yet, how can that be? Our senses, along with our thoughts, are all linked to the workings of our brain. At death, the brain stops working. Our memories, feelings, and senses do not continue to function independently in some mysterious way. They do not survive the destruction of our brain.”[<https://www.jw.org/en/library/books/bible-teach/where-are-the-dead/>]
- What does the Bible teach about the condition of the dead? Again, Witnesses deny that any part of a human survives death: “5 What happens at death is no mystery to Jehovah, the Creator of the brain. He knows the truth, and in his Word, the Bible, he explains the condition of the dead. Its clear teaching is this: When a person dies, he ceases to exist. Death is the opposite of life. The dead do not see or hear or think. Not even one part of us survives the death of the body. We do not possess an immortal soul or spirit.” \* 6 After Solomon observed that the living know that they will die, he wrote: “But the dead know



nothing at all.” He then enlarged on that basic truth by saying that the dead can neither love nor hate and that “there is no work nor planning nor knowledge nor wisdom in the Grave.” (Read Ecclesiastes 9:5, 6, 10.) Similarly, Psalm 146:4 says that when a man dies, “his thoughts perish.” We are mortal and do not survive the death of our body. The life we enjoy is like the flame of a candle. When the flame is put out, it does not go anywhere. It is simply gone. [WHAT REALLY HAPPENS AT DEATH? 5, 6.]

